E-Served: Oct 17 2022 5:06PM PDT Via Case Anywhere

| 1 2 | Douglas P. Dehler (admitted Pro Hac Vice) Gregory W. Lyons (admitted Pro Hac Vice) O'NEIL, CANNON, HOLLMAN, DEJONG & LAING S.C. | |
|--|--|---|
| 3 | 111 East Wisconsin Avenue, Suite 1400 | |
| 4 | Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202 | |
| 5 | Telephone: (414) 276-5000 Facsimile: (414) 276-6581 | |
| 6 | E-Mail: doug.dehler@wilaw.com E-mail: greg.lyons@wilaw.com | |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | Gretchen M. Nelson (SBN 112566) Gabriel S. Barenfeld (SBN 224146) NELSON & FRAENKEL LLP | |
| | 601 S. Figueroa Street, Suite 2050 Los Angeles, CA 90017 | |
| 10 | Telephone: (844) 622-6469 | |
| 11 | Facsimile: (213) 622-6019 E-Mail: gnelson@nflawfirm.com | |
| 12 | E-Mail: gbarenfeld@nflawfirm.com | |
| 13 | Attorneys for Plaintiffs Manuel I. Figueroa, M.D. | ., |
| 1 1 | and the Proposed Class | |
| 14 | | |
| | SUPERIOR COURT FOR T | HE STATE OF CALIFORNIA |
| 15 | | HE STATE OF CALIFORNIA LOS ANGELES |
| 14 15 16 17 | | |
| 15 16 17 | COUNTY OF MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on | LOS ANGELES Case No. BC645344 |
| 15 16 17 18 | COUNTY OF | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) |
| 15 16 17 18 | COUNTY OF MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on behalf of himself and other persons similarly | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) CLASS ACTION |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 | MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on behalf of himself and other persons similarly situated, | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) CLASS ACTION NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | COUNTY OF MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on behalf of himself and other persons similarly situated, Plaintiffs, vs. MOLINA HEALTHCARE OF | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) CLASS ACTION NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | COUNTY OF MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on behalf of himself and other persons similarly situated, Plaintiffs, vs. | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) CLASS ACTION NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY |
| 115 116 117 118 119 220 221 222 223 | COUNTY OF MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on behalf of himself and other persons similarly situated, Plaintiffs, vs. MOLINA HEALTHCARE OF | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) CLASS ACTION NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION |
| 15 16 | MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on behalf of himself and other persons similarly situated, Plaintiffs, vs. MOLINA HEALTHCARE OF CALIFORNIA, INC., | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) CLASS ACTION NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION |
| 115 116 117 118 119 220 221 222 223 224 | MANUEL I. FIGUEROA, M.D., for and on behalf of himself and other persons similarly situated, Plaintiffs, vs. MOLINA HEALTHCARE OF CALIFORNIA, INC., | Case No. BC645344 (Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman, Dept. 14) CLASS ACTION NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION |

28



Douglas P. Dehler (admitted Pro Hac Vice)

1

Having considered Plaintiff's Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement, filed on October 22, 2021 (the "Motion for Preliminary Approval"), which seeks an Order that (1) grants preliminary approval of the Settlement Agreement; (2) certifies the class for settlement purposes; (3) appoints class counsel as counsel for the provisionally certified settlement class; (4) approves the proposed plan of notice and notice to the Settlement Class; (5) appoints JND Legal Administration as the Settlement Administrator; (6) sets a schedule for disseminating notice to the Settlement Class as well as other deadlines related to the administration of the settlement, including deadlines to object to or opt out of the settlement; and (7) schedules a final approval hearing, as well as Plaintiff's Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement and the supporting Declarations of Laura J. Lavey, Gretchen M. Nelson, and Manuel I. Figueroa, M.D. each filed on October 22, 2021; Plaintiff's Revised Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement and the supporting Declaration of Douglas P. Dehler filed on July 13, 2022; and all other papers filed in this Lawsuit, the Court hereby FINDS, CONCLUDES, and ORDERS as follows:

- 1. Plaintiff Manuel I. Figueroa, M.D. ("Plaintiff") and Defendant Molina Healthcare of California (identified as Molina Healthcare of California, Inc. in the Lawsuit) ("Molina"), through their counsel of record in this Lawsuit, have reached an agreement to settle all claims in the Lawsuit.
- 2. The Parties have agreed, for Settlement purposes only, that this Lawsuit may be maintained as a class action.
- 3. The Court, having reviewed the terms of the proposed Settlement, as well as the Declarations of Laura J. Lavey, Gretchen M. Nelson, Manuel I. Figueroa, M.D., and Douglas P. Dehler filed in support of the Motion for Preliminary Approval describing Plaintiff's investigation into the claims and defenses in this matter; the information exchanged between the Parties; the past proceedings in this Lawsuit; and the process and procedures for the Settlement, preliminarily finds that the proposed Settlement is the product of informed, non-collusive, and arm's length negotiations and is within the range of possible approval as fair, reasonable, and adequate, such that notice should be given to the Settlement Class.

25

26 27

28

4. The moving papers presented for the Court's review in support of the Motion for Preliminary Approval set forth a plan to provide notice to the proposed Settlement Class of the terms of the Revised Settlement Agreement and the options provided to the Settlement Class—specifically, to (a) do nothing and, thus, accept the terms of the Settlement, including the amount of the Individual Settlement Payment identified in the Notice; (b) accept the terms of the Settlement, but dispute the amount of the Individual Settlement Payment identified in the Notice; (c) object to the Settlement in its entirety, but agree to receive only the Individual Settlement Payment identified in the Notice if the Settlement is approved by the Court; and (d) Opt Out of the Settlement. The Parties' proposed Notice attached to the Revised Settlement Agreement as Exhibit A will be mailed to members of the Settlement Class at their last-known address, and any Notice that is returned will be promptly resent to any forwarding address. The Settlement Administrator will update and confirm current addresses for members of the Settlement Class based on public information available for such medical providers and will use standard skip tracing procedures, as necessary, to obtain any forwarding address information. The Settlement Administrator will also use alternative or additional methods to contact members of the Settlement Class, including, but not limited to, electronic mail or other electronic notification, as necessary and based on any alternative or additional contact information in Molina's possession. The Parties' proposed Notice and the notice plan set forth in the Revised Settlement Agreement provides the best practicable notice; it is reasonably calculated, under the circumstances, to apprise the Settlement Class of the pendency of the Lawsuit and of their right to object to or to exclude themselves from the proposed Settlement; it is reasonable and constitutes due, adequate and sufficient notice to all providers entitled to receive notice; and it meets all requirements of applicable law.

Good cause appearing therefore, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED as follows:

- 1. The Court preliminarily approves the proposed Settlement.
- Capitalized terms not otherwise defined herein shall have the same meanings as set 2. forth in the Revised Settlement Agreement.
- 3. The Settlement Class is provisionally certified for settlement purposes only, pursuant to section 382 of the Code of Civil Procedure. For settlement purposes only, the Lawsuit may be

maintained on behalf of a Settlement Class defined as follows: "All California medical providers qualified to receive Enhanced Payments under Section 1202 of the ACA for eligible E&M Services provided to Molina's health plan members between January 1, 2013 and December 31, 2014 who submitted claims or encounters for such services to Molina, which claims or encounters were not denied prior to the filing of the Lawsuit, and who Molina's records indicate did not receive Enhanced Payments from Molina for some or all of those claims or encounters. According to Molina's records, there are 3,464 providers within the Settlement Class."

- 4. Plaintiff Manuel I. Figueroa, M.D. is appointed as the class representative, and Plaintiffs' counsel, Douglas P. Dehler and Gregory W. Lyons of O'Neil, Cannon, Hollman, DeJong & Laing S.C. and Gretchen M. Nelson and Gabriel S. Barenfeld of Nelson & Fraenkel LLP are appointed as Class Counsel for the Settlement Class Members.
- 5. JND Legal Administration, also known as JND, is appointed as the Settlement Administrator and is tasked with providing the Notice to the Settlement Class as set forth in this Order and otherwise administering the Settlement in accordance with the terms of the Revised Settlement Agreement.
- 6. The Court hereby approves the form of the Notice of Proposed Settlement of Class Action, which is attached to the Revised Settlement Agreement as Exhibit A.
- 7. The Notice shall be sent to the Settlement Class by first-class United States mail according to the terms set forth in the Revised Settlement Agreement and the schedule set forth below. Molina shall provide the Settlement Administrator with the information necessary to conduct this mailing in accordance with the terms set forth in the Revised Settlement Agreement.
- 8. The Settlement Administrator shall file proof of compliance with the Notice provisions of the Revised Settlement Agreement no later than November 2, 2023.
- 9. Any member of the Settlement Class who wishes to exclude himself or herself from the Settlement Class shall submit an appropriate, timely request for exclusion to the Settlement Administrator, postmarked no later than the Opt-Out Date (60 days after the date on which the Notice is sent) or, in the case of a Remailed Notice, the Extended Opt-Out Date (90 days after the Notice

Date) in compliance with the provisions of the Revised Settlement Agreement and as set forth in the Notice.

- 10. Any member of the Settlement Class who does not timely and validly Opt Out of the Settlement Class will be bound by all proceedings and orders in the Lawsuit.
- 11. Any Settlement Class Member who does not Opt Out and who wishes to object to the fairness, reasonableness or adequacy of the Settlement or the requested Class Counsel Fee Payment or Incentive Award Payment shall submit an appropriate, timely Objection to the Settlement Administrator, postmarked no later than the Objection Date (60 days after the date on which the Notice is sent) or, in the case of a Remailed Notice, the Extended Objection Date (30 days after the Objection Date) in compliance with the provisions of the Revised Settlement Agreement and as set forth in the Notice.
 - 12. Any responses to any Objection shall be included in the Motion for Final Approval.
- 13. The Settlement Administrator shall establish a post office box in the name of the Settlement Administrator to be used for receiving requests for exclusion and any other communication relating to the Settlement. Only the Settlement Administrator, Class Counsel, Defendant's Counsel, the Court, and the Clerk of Court and their designated agents shall have access to this post office box, except as otherwise provided in the Revised Settlement Agreement.
- 14. Class Counsel shall file any applications for a Class Counsel Fee Payment and an Incentive Award Payment at least thirty-five (35) days prior to the Opt-Out Date and Objection Date.
- 15. The Settlement Administrator shall provide the Opt-Out List to Class Counsel and Defendant's Counsel within fifteen (15) days after the Opt-Out Date or, where appropriate, the Extended Opt-Out Date. The Settlement Administrator shall also file with the Court the Opt-Out List with an affidavit attesting to the completeness and accuracy thereof no later than November 2, 2023.
- 16. A hearing shall be held before this Court on November 9, 2023 at 10 a.m. in Department 14 to consider whether the Settlement should be given final approval by the Court. This hearing may be postponed by the Court without additional notice to members of the Settlement Class.
 - 17. The Court issues the following schedule for further proceedings:

| 1 | Event | Date |
|----|--|---|
| 1 | Molina to Provide the Settlement | 15 days after the Preliminary Approval Order |
| 2 | Administrator and Class Counsel the | is entered |
| 3 | Settlement Class List and the Individual | |
| 3 | Settlement Payment Summary | 20 1 |
| 4 | Notice of Proposed Settlement of Class Action to be Mailed | 30 days after receipt of the Settlement Class List and the Individual Settlement Payment |
| 5 | to be Maried | Summary or 45 days after the Preliminary |
| 3 | | Approval Order is entered, whichever is later. |
| 6 | Application for fee request and incentive award | 35 days before Opt-Out Date and Objection |
| 7 | filed | Date |
| | Deadline to Opt-Out of the Settlement | 60 days from the date of the Notice (or 90 days |
| 8 | - | from the date of the Notice for any Remailed |
| 9 | | Notice) |
| | Deadline to Object to the Settlement | 60 days from the date of the Notice (the |
| 10 | | "Objection Date") (or 30 days from the |
| 11 | | Objection Date for any Remailed Notice) |
| | Settlement Administrator to provide final list of | 15 days after Opt-Out Date or, where |
| 12 | Opt-Outs to counsel | appropriate, the Extended Opt-Out Date |
| 13 | Deadline for Molina to terminate agreement based on number of Opt-Outs | 15 days after receipt of Opt-Out List |
| 14 | Deadline for Settlement Class Members to | 100 days from the date of the Notice or 100 |
| 17 | dispute Individual Settlement Payments | days from the date of any Remailed Notice |
| 15 | Deficiency notices to be sent to Disputing | 30 days from receiving dispute information |
| 16 | Settlement Class Members (in the event initial | from Disputing Settlement Class Member |
| | supporting documentation provided is | |
| 17 | deficient) | 20 Jane often Jaffelen av metice |
| 18 | Disputing Settlement Class Member to provide additional supporting information in response | 20 days after deficiency notice |
| | to deficiency notice (if one is sent) | |
| 19 | Settlement Administrator to notify Molina of | 15 days after deadline for Disputing Settlement |
| 20 | disputed claims and provide supporting | Class Members to provide supporting |
| | information | documentation or cure any deficiencies |
| 21 | Molina to provide its own evidence if disputing | 45 days after notice from Settlement |
| 22 | claim made by Disputing Settlement Class | Administrator of dispute and supporting |
| | Member (Disputed Claim) OR Molina to agree | information |
| 23 | to pay disputed amount (Agreed Claim) | 20.1 |
| 24 | Determination by Settlement Administrator of | 30 days after Molina submits evidence |
| 25 | disputed claims | disputing claims made by Disputing Settlement Class Member |
| | Dispute Report provided by Settlement | 10 days of final adjudication of disputed claims |
| 26 | Administrator | |
| 27 | Deadline for Molina to terminate agreement | 15 days from receipt of Dispute Report |
| | based on total amount of disputed claims to be | |
| 28 | paid to Disputing Settlement Class Members | |

| Deadline to file Motion for final approval | 45 days after receipt of Dispute Report, but no |
|--|---|
| | later than October 9, 2023 |
| Settlement Administrator to file final report on | November 2, 2023 |
| Notice, Opt-Outs, Objections, Disputed | |
| Claims, and additional key metrics | |
| Final Approval Hearing | November 9, 2023 at 10:00 a.m. |
| Molina to pay to Settlement Administrator | 30 days after final approval order |
| funds necessary to cover all settlement | |
| payments, class counsel fee payment, and | |
| incentive award payment | |
| Effective Date | When appeal deadlines have run and/or all |
| | appeals resolved |
| Payment of settlement payments, class counsel | 21 days after Effective Date |
| fee payment, and incentive award payment | |
| Deadline for Settlement Class Members to cash | 270 days after payment of settlement payments |
| checks | |
| Settlement Administrator to provide | 290 days after Effective Date |
| declaration of payments made and status of | |
| checks cashed | |
| Deadline for class counsel to file Final Report | 300 days after Effective Date |
| Cy pres payment to be made | 15 days after Final Report |

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: 10/17/2022



Hon. Kenneth R. Freeman Judge of the Superior Court Kenneth R. Freeman/Judge

| 1 | | |
|----------|---|--|
| 2 | PROOF OF SERVICE | |
| 3 | I, the undersigned, declare: | |
| 4 | I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 | |
| 5 | and not a party to the within action; my business address is 601 So. Figueroa St., Suite 2050, Los | |
| 6 | Angeles, California 90017. | |
| 7 | On September 26, 2022, I served the foregoing documents described as follows: | |
| 8 | [PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT | |
| 10 | on the interested parties in this action by placing true copies thereof enclosed in sealed envelopes addressed as stated on the attached service list, and in the manner stated below: | |
| 11 | X BY ELECTRONIC SERVICE | |
| 12 | served by e-mail through Case Anywhere: I attached a true and correct copy of the above-entitled document(s) to Case Anywhere by electronic transfer for service on all counsel of record by | |
| 13 | electronic service pursuant to the Order Authorizing Electronic Service. This service complies with C.C.P. §1010.6. | |
| 14 | BY MAIL: | |
| 15 | I am "readily familiar" with the firm's practice of collection and processing correspondence for mailing. Under that practice, it would be deposited with the U.S. | |
| 16 17 | Postal Service on that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at Los Angeles, California in the ordinary course of business. I am aware that on motion of the party served, service is presumed invalid if postal cancellation date or postage meter date is more than one day after date of deposit for mailing in affidavit. | |
| 18 | more than one day area date of deposit for maning in arridaviti | |
| 19 | BY PERSONAL SERVICE: I caused to be delivered such envelope by hand to the offices of the addressee. | |
| 20 | r sausseu to de den vereu such en verepe dy nama to the enrices of the dadressee. | |
| 21 | BY FEDERAL EXPRESS OR OVERNIGHT CARRIER | |
| 22 | V (Ctata) I de along von den namelten af naminann von den the leaves af the Ctata af California that | |
| 23 | X (State) I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct. | |
| 24 | Executed on September 26, 2022, at Los Angeles, California. | |
| 25 | n:11b0- | |
| 26 | Michael P. Levin (Type or Print Name) (Signature) | |
| 27 | (Digitatio) | |
| 28 | | |

| 1 | SERVICE LIST Figueroa, M.D. v. Molina Healthcare of California, Inc., et al. Case No. BC645344 | |
|----|--|--|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | Douglas P. Dehler Gregory W. Lyons | Attorneys for Plaintiffs |
| 4 | O'NEIL, CANNON, HOLLMAN, et al. 111 East Wisconsin Ave., Suite 1400 | Manuel I. Figueroa, M.D., and the Proposed Class |
| 5 | Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202-4870 | |
| 6 | Phone: (414) 276- 5000 Fax: (414)276- 6581 | |
| 7 | doug.dehler@wilaw.com greg.lyons@wilaw.com | |
| 8 | Quyen L. Ta | Attorneys for Defendant |
| 9 | KING & SPALDING LLP 101 Second Street, Suite 1000 Second Street, Suite 104105 | Molina Healthcare of California, Inc |
| 10 | San Francisco, California 94105 Telephone: (415) 318-1227 | |
| 11 | Facsimile: (415) 318-1300 Email: qta@kslaw.com | |
| 12 | Craig H. Bessenger KING & SPALDING LLP | Attorneys for Defendant Molina Healthcare of California, Inc |
| 13 | 633 West Fifth Street, Suite 1600 | Withing Healtheare of Camorina, me |
| 14 | Los Angeles, California 90071 Telephone: (213) 443-4355 | |
| 15 | Facsimile: (213) 443-4310 Email: cbessenger@kslaw.com | |
| 16 | Email. coessenger(wasiaw.com | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | 2 |

| 1 | DDOOF OF SEDVICE | |
|--|--|--|
| 2 | PROOF OF SERVICE | |
| 3 | I, the undersigned, declare: | |
| 4 | I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 | |
| 5 | and not a party to the within action; my business address is 601 So. Figueroa St., Suite 2050, Los | |
| 6 | Angeles, California 90017. | |
| 7 | On October 17, 2022, I served the foregoing documents described as follows: | |
| 8 | NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT | |
| 10 | on the interested parties in this action by placing true copies thereof enclosed in sealed envelopes addressed as stated on the attached service list, and in the manner stated below: | |
| 111213 | X BY ELECTRONIC SERVICE served by e-mail through Case Anywhere: I attached a true and correct copy of the above-entitled document(s) to Case Anywhere by electronic transfer for service on all counsel of record by | |
| 14 15 | electronic service pursuant to the Order Authorizing Electronic Service. This service complies with C.C.P. §1010.6. BY MAIL: I am "readily familiar" with the firm's practice of collection and processing | |
| 161718 | correspondence for mailing. Under that practice, it would be deposited with the U.S. Postal Service on that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at Los Angeles, California in the ordinary course of business. I am aware that on motion of the party served, service is presumed invalid if postal cancellation date or postage meter date is more than one day after date of deposit for mailing in affidavit. | |
| 19 20 | BY PERSONAL SERVICE: I caused to be delivered such envelope by hand to the offices of the addressee. | |
| 2122 | BY FEDERAL EXPRESS OR OVERNIGHT CARRIER | |
| 2324 | X (State) I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct. | |
| 25 | Executed on October 17, 2022, at Los Angeles, California. | |
| 26 | <u>Karina Torres</u> <u>Karina Torres</u> (Signature) | |
| 27 | (Type or Print Name) (Signature) | |
| 28 | | |

| 1 | <u>SERVICE LIST</u> Figueroa, M.D. v. Molina Healthcare of California, Inc., et al. | |
|----|--|--|
| 2 | Cas | e No. BC645344 |
| 3 | Douglas P. Dehler | Attorneys for Plaintiffs |
| 4 | Gregory W. Lyons O'NEIL, CANNON, HOLLMAN, et al. 111 East Wisconsin Ave., Suite 1400 | Manuel I. Figueroa, M.D., and the Proposed Class |
| 5 | Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202-4870 Phone: (414) 276- 5000 | |
| 6 | Fax: (414)276- 6581 doug.dehler@wilaw.com | |
| 7 | greg.lyons@wilaw.com | |
| 8 | Quyen L. Ta KING & SPALDING LLP | Attorneys for Defendant |
| 9 | 101 Second Street, Suite 1000 | Molina Healthcare of California, Inc |
| 10 | San Francisco, California 94105 Telephone: (415) 318-1227 | |
| 11 | Facsimile: (415) 318-1300 Email: gta@kslaw.com | |
| 12 | Craig H. Bessenger | Attorneys for Defendant |
| 13 | KING & SPALDING LLP 633 West Fifth Street, Suite 1600 | Molina Healthcare of California, Inc |
| 14 | Los Angeles, California 90071 Telephone: (213) 443-4355 | |
| 15 | Facsimile: (213) 443-4310 | |
| 16 | Email: <u>cbessenger@kslaw.com</u> | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |